

MSCA evaluation criteria – What makes the difference?

Petr Roubal, Institute of Contemporary History of the Czech Academy of Sciences

Nobody's perfect: Limits of the evaluators and the evaluation process.

- limited expertise in the particular field
- lack of knowledge of Eastern and Central Europe
- consensus imperative
- varied level of experience of the experts/evaluators and limited role of Vice-Chairman
- time pressure

What does it mean for the writing of the proposal?

- formal quality of the proposal is crucial (logic of reasoning, style, language)
- proposal should aim at more general goals/objectives understandable beyond narrow field of particular expertise
- inconsistency in evaluation across the years is normal part of the process

Criterion 1 – Excellence

- How relevant are the objectives?
- Is it ambitious? x Is it realistic?
- Does it go beyond the state of the art?
- Are the objectives measurable?
- How solid is the methodology of the proposal?
- Interdisciplinarity – How well will the methods from different disciplines be integrated?
- Were the methodological challenges identified and addressed?
- Gender/diversity
- Open science practices.
- Supervisor – experience in the field + in supervision, track-record (incl. major intern. collaborations)
- Are the planned training activities effective for the researcher?
- Existing professional experience and competencies – Are they relevant for the proposed research?

Criterion 2 – Impact

- How convincing are the measures to improve the career perspectives?
- How the MSCA will add to the skills set?
- Dissemination – How suitable? What are the target groups?
- Communication/ public engagement - objectives, main messages, tools and channels of the activities.
- Scientific, societal and economic impacts – What are they and how are they quantified?

Criterion 3 – Implementation

- Is the work plan effective?
- Does it include deliverables and milestones?
- Is the timing and duration of work packages appropriate?
- Risk – identified and addressed?
- Gantt Chart
- Hosting arrangements – support services, integration
- Quality and capacity of the hosting organisation.